

CONGREGATIONAL DHIKR AFTER SALAT: AN ISLAMIC JURISPRUDENTIAL ANALYSIS

**KHAIRUL FAHMI JAMALUDIN¹
MOHAMAD ASMADI ABDULLAH²
MOHAMAD SABRI ZAKARIA³
AFRIDAH ABAS⁴**

The coming of Islam to Tanah Melayu has introduced various religious practices and rituals to Muslim community based on Shafi'e madhab. These religious practices have been modified and amalgamated with the customs of Malay community in Malaysia. Among them is the practice of congregational dhikr after daily prayer in which Muslim community in Malaysia have been accustomed with for generations. In recent decades, a group called the Salafi doctrine which is known for their call to return to Quran, sunnah and the practice of Salaf al-Salih has disputed various religious practices in Malaysia which includes congregational dhikr. As the disputes and objection by the Salafi doctrine has caused quarrel and fight among Muslim, various fatwa institutions in Malaysia have issued official fatwa on this practice for the purpose of maintaining unity and harmony within the Muslim community in Malaysia. This paper aims to study the methodology of ijtihad employed by four madhab and Salafi doctrine in deriving hukm (ruling) from Quran and Sunnah of the Prophet Muhammad (s.a.w.) as well as other sources of Islamic law in order to understand the reason for their disagreements and how to handle this disagreement properly. The paper adopts library research that will analyse of various Islamic law sources and writing of classical jurist of four (4) madhab. This paper reveals that four madhabs uses various rules of interpretation and relying on various sources of Islamic law in ijtihad process. While Salafi doctrine, on the other hand, focuses on using literal understanding and only relied on Quran and Sunnah of the Prophet Muhammad (s.a.w.) as well as the concept of al-Tark (Omission) in the

- 1 PhD Candidate, Ahmad Ibrahim Kulliyah of Laws, International Islamic University Malaysia, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, Email: khairulfahmi787@yahoo.com
- 2 Associate Professor, Ahmad Ibrahim Kulliyah of Laws, International Islamic University Malaysia, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, Email: masmadi@iium.edu.my
- 3 Assistant Professor, Kulliyah of Islamic Revealed Knowledge and Human Sciences, International Islamic University Malaysia, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, Email: sabriz@iium.edu.my
- 4 Assistant Professor, Ahmad Ibrahim Kulliyah of Laws, International Islamic University Malaysia, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, Email: afridah@iium.edu.my

rule-making process. It is hoped that this paper will give a better understanding on the reason for the differences in the methodology of ijtihad between these two groups that can help to preserve and maintain the unity and harmony within Muslim community in Malaysia.

INTRODUCTION

The practice of *dhikr* is something that has been commanded in various Quranic verses¹ and *Sunnah*² of the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*). This *dhikr* has been practised by *Salaf al-Salih* that consist of the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) himself, his companion, *tabi'in*, *atba' tabi'in* as well as the period after. Even though Muslim scholars have different views with regard to the status of congregational *dhikr*, it is still widely practiced by Muslim community until today.

The issue of congregational *dhikr* after prayer has been going on in Malaysia for quite some time. However, based on the materials that are available to the researcher, this issue started in 1953 when Abu Zahidah and Abu Qani'ah in discussing this issue decided to support this practice in their book³. Later in 1954, Abu Bakar al-Asha'ari advocated a contrasting view on this issue⁴. Next, in 1970, Sirajuddin Abbas in his four-chaptered book⁵ had supported the position taken by Abu Zahidah and Abu Qani'ah. Three decades later, in 2005, Mohd Asri in his book⁶ provided a different view from Kiyai Sirajuddin. Finally, in 2005, Muhadir Jol affirmed the practice of congregational *dhikr* in his book⁷. While in the state fatwa institutions, there are several states that has issued *fatwa* supporting the matter at hands such as Kedah,⁸ Perak,⁹ Selangor,¹⁰ Negeri Sembilan,¹¹ Pahang,¹² Johor,¹³ and Sabah.¹⁴

TYPES OF CONGREGATIONAL DHIKR

Generally, congregational *dhikr* comes in several forms¹⁵, which are as follows:

- (a) A group of people who comes together in the same place and in the same occasion where one person will preach and give reminder and advice to others or teach others about the *halal* (permissible) and *haram* (forbidden) things in Islam or teach others about knowledge on Islam. This is *dhikr* in literal understanding.

- (b) A group of people who comes together in the same place and event where everyone in the group is doing *dhikr* individually be it *jahr* (aloud) or *sirr* (secretly). This practice can be considered as congregational *dhikr*. However, it is not the issue that the writer has in mind.
- (c) A group of people who comes together in the same place and event where everyone is reciting the same *dhikr* without any leader in command. This form of congregational *dhikr* also is not what the writer meant.
- (d) A group of people comes together in the same place and occasion where everyone is reciting the same *dhikr* following one leader in command. This is the form of *dhikr* being disputed by some scholars.

If we can combine four last forms of *dhikr*, it can be concluded that congregational *dhikr* is a gathering in an occasion where a recitation of *dhikr* is done by following one leader. In the next subtopic, the paper will further delve into the scholarly discussion surrounding the issue of congregational *dhikr*.

DIFFERENT OPINION AMONG SCHOLARS REGARDING CONGREGATIONAL DHIKR

Moving on to the main discussion of this paper, the difference of opinion between Muslim scholars on this matter can be simplified into two groups. The first group is basically those who are in favour of this practice while the second group is made of those who oppose this practice and opine that it must be stopped from being spread in Muslim community. The writer will further discuss the differences of opinion along with the authorities being relied upon in the next subheading.

THE SUPPORTER OF CONGREGATIONAL DHIKR

This group is representing the opinion of *Jumbur* (majority) of scholar which consist some of Hanafiyyah,¹⁶ Malikiyyah¹⁷, Shafi'yyah¹⁸, and Hanabilah¹⁹ scholars. They are of the opinion

that the practice of congregational *dhikr* is *mustahabb* (recommended). Among Hanafiyyah scholars who opined that congregational *dhikr* is *mustahabb* are Imam al- Laknawi²⁰, Imam Mulla ‘Ali Qari²¹, Imam ‘Abd al- Haqq al- Dahlawi²² and Imam Khayr al- Din al-Ramli. Among Malikiyyah scholars who opined that congregational *dhikr* is *mustahabb* are Imam Malik Ibn Anas²³, Imam Ibn Naji al- Tanukhi²⁴ and al- ‘Allamah al- Nafrawi.²⁵ Among Shafi’eyyah scholars who agreed with the opinion of *Jumhur* in saying congregational *dhikr* is *mustahabb* are Imam al- Nawawi²⁶, Shaykh al- Islam Zakariyya al- Ansari²⁷ and Imam Khatib al- Sharbini.²⁸ Among Hanabilah scholars who opined congregational is *mustahabb* are Shaykh al- Islam Ta qi al-Din ibn Taimiyyah²⁹ and al- ‘Allamah Mansur Ibn Yunus al- Buhuti al- Hanbali.³⁰

This first group does not differentiate between continuously doing congregational *dhikr* or doing it periodically since according to them, both practices still carry the same *hukm* (ruling), i.e., *mustahabb* (recommended). There are several authorities relied upon by the scholars of this group. Firstly, there is a Quranic verse that states: “*Men who celebrate the praises of Allah, standing, sitting, and lying down on their sides, and contemplate the (wonders of) creation in the heavens and the earth, (With the thought): Our Lord! not for naught Hast Thou created (all) this! Glory to Thee! Give us salvation from the penalty of the Fire*”.³¹

The second authority is mentioned in Surah al- Jumu’ah, where Allah (*s.w.t.*) states that: “*through the land, and seek of the Bounty of Allah: and celebrate the Praises of Allah often (and without stint): that ye may prosper*”.³² From the above Quranic verses, it is clear that Allah (*s.w.t.*) has commanded Muslim to do *dhikr* at any time and as many *dhikr* as possible³³. It is mentioned that it may be done whilst standing, lying on side and sitting as well as during day or night. There is no restriction imposed as to the place, time or specific way to do *dhikr*³⁴.

The third authority is a hadith narrated by ‘Aishah where she said that: “*the Prophet Muhammad (s.a.w.) was asked: What deeds are most loved most by Allah? He said: the most regular constant deeds even though they may be few. He added: take upon yourselves only those*

deeds which are within your ability".³⁵ From the above *hadith* it can be understood that the best and most loved deed by Allah (*s.w.t.*) is the deed that is done constantly and regularly even if it is not much. This is a general *hadith* that do not require the deed to be performed in any specific way or place or within specific period of time. This mean, any good deed be it *dhikr* or *sadaqah* or recitation of Quran, if it is performed on regular basis be it before *salat* or after *salat*, it will be among the deed that most loved by Allah (*s.w.t.*). Furthermore, since this *hadith* and the previous Quranic verses is a general commandment to do good deed regularly that is not tied with any other requirement, as long as there is no Quranic verse or other *hadith* that specify otherwise, it will remain on its generality regardless of time, place and the way of performing it.³⁶

Fourthly, in another relevant *hadith* narrated by Abu Hurayrah (*r.a.*) related to congregational *dhikr*: "*The Messenger of Allah said: Allah has some angels who look for those who remember (glorify the Praises of) Allah on the roads and path. And when they find some people remembering (glorifying the Praises of) Allah, they call each other saying: Come to the object of your pursuit. He added: Then the angels encircle them with their wings up to the nearest heaven to us. He added: (After those people remembered [glorified the Praise of Allah and the angels go back to Allah] their Lord 'Azza wa Jalla asks them (those angels) - though He knows better than them - What do my Slaves say? the angels reply: they say Subhanallah, Allahuakbar, and Alhamdulillah. Allah then says: did they see me? the angels reply: No! By Allah, they did not see you. Allah says: How it would have been if they saw me? the angels reply: If they saw you, they would worship you more devoutly and remember You (glorify Your Praises) more deeply and declare Your freedom from any resemblance to anything more often...*"³⁷

In the above *hadith*, it can be seen that the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) used the word in *al- Jam'u* (plural) form that was added with the letter "waw" and "nun" in the word "*yadhkurun*". This is a very basic principle in Arabic grammar that refers to the concept of *Jam'u Mudhakkir al- Salim* to indicate that the *dhikr* was done in group. The usage of plural form also extends to other words such as the word of "*yusabbihunaka*", "*yukabbirunaka*",

and”*yumajjidunaka*”. These words, in particular, serve as the explanation to the earlier word of *dhikr* and at the same time it rejects the possibility of it being interpreted as *Majalis al- ‘Ilm* (knowledge discussion). This is clearly specified by the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) in the above *hadith* when he described the *dhikr* of *tasbih* (*Subhanallah*), *tablil* (*Lailahailallah*) and *takbir* (*Allahu Akbar*). This *hadith* is considered as one of the main authorities that allows the practice of congregational *dhikr*. There is no requirement stating that congregational *dhikr* must be done in a very specific manner such as following one leader and must be chanted in one voice. As long the *dhikr* is done in group, then it is sufficed to be considered as congregational *dhikr*.

Fifthly, in another *hadith*, Abu Ma’bad from Ibn ‘Abbas narrated that: “*Narrated Abu Ma’bad, the freed slave of Ibn ‘Abbas: Ibn Abbas (r.a.) told me. “In the lifetime of the Prophet Muhammad (s.a.w.) it was the custom to remember Allah (Dhikr) by glorifying, praising and magnifying Allah aloud after the compulsory congregational Salat (prayers)”. Ibn ‘Abbas further said: “when I heard the dhikr, I would learn that the compulsory congregational Salat had ended”.*³⁸ From the above *hadith*, it can be understood that Ibn ‘Abbas will know that the compulsory congregational prayer has ended when he heard to the loud voice of *dhikr* by other companions. This *hadith* does not only establish the fact that the *dhikr* is done in congregation during the period of the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*), but it also highlights the fact that the *dhikr* is done in loud manner to the extent it can be heard from afar.

Sixthly, another *hadith* that is relevant to be discussed at this point is the *hadith* narrated by Abu Sa’eid al- Khudri (*r.a.*) in which he said: “*Mu’awiyah came out to a circle (gathering) in the mosque and said: Why are you sitting here? They said: We are sitting to remember Allah. He said: by Allah, are you only sitting for that purpose? They said: by Allah, we are only sitting for that purpose. He said: I did not ask you to swear because I am accusing you. There is no one of my status in relation to the Messenger of Allah who has narrated fewer Ahadith from him than me. The messenger of Allah came out to a circle of his Companions and said: Why are you sitting here? They said: we*

are sitting to remember Allah, and praise Him for having guided us to Islam and blessed us with it. He said: by Allah, are you only sitting for that purpose? They said: by Allah, we are only sitting for that purpose. He said: I did not ask you to swear because I am accusing you, but Jibril came to me and told me that Allah was boasting of you to the angels”.³⁹

The above *hadith* implies that there is no other meaning that can be understood from it except it refers to the practice of congregational *dhikr*. This *hadith* constitutes a valid authority that suggests the Companions of the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) also participated in congregational *dhikr*, and it should be an ample answer for those who said the Companion had never participated in the practice of congregational *dhikr*⁴⁰. From this *hadith*, it is obvious that the Companions did participate in congregational *dhikr*, hence it is allowed in Islam.

Seventhly, there is a *hadith* of the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) narrated by Ya'la ibn Shadad related to congregational *dhikr* following one leader is as follow: “*We are sitting beside the Prophet Muhammad (s.a.w.) where he said: is there among you gharib, i.e., Ahl al- Kitab? We answered: there is no Ahl al- Kitab among us Ya Rasulallah. He asked us to close the door and said: raise your hand and say” La Ilah Illa Allah” and we raised our hand for a moment and then the Prophet Muhammad (s.a.w.) put down his hand and said: Praise to Allah that has sent me with this word and commanded me with it and promised me with it paradise. And He will not breach His promise and he further said; cheer up and be happy for Allah ‘Azza wa Jalla has forgiven all of you”*⁴¹.

In this *hadith*, when the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) asked the companion to repeat the word of *tawhid* (*La Ilah Illa Allah*), it is an indication that congregational *dhikr* is permissible because it has been shown by the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) and being followed by the companion. When the companion repeats the word together in that particular moment following the word uttered by the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*), it seems that their action is not that different and quite similar to congregational *dhikr* that is being practised by many Muslim nowadays, i.e., congregational *dhikr* following one leader in one voice. Hence,

this hadith is a clear example that renders congregational *dhikr* allowed to be practised.

There are numerous Muslim scholars who support the practice of congregational *dhikr* including Ibn Taimiyyah. In one of his book⁴² when Ibn Taimiyyah was asked about congregational *dhikr*, he answered that doing collective *dhikr* to Allah (*s.w.t.*), and listening to Quran as well as *du'a* are good deeds and considered as among the best worship acts as mentioned in one *hadith* where the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) mentioned about the angels, whose task is to find those who do *dhikr* (remembering and glorifying) to Allah (*s.w.t.*) on the roads and path⁴³. When these angels find the people who do *dhikr*, they will bring the *du'a* and wish of these people back to Allah (*s.w.t.*) to be granted. Ibn Taymiyyah further added that congregational *dhikr* be it individual or in congregation is something that has been practised by the Companions of the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*), thus making it recommended and permissible in Islam⁴⁴.

This is the position taken by al-Shafi'e in the issue of congregational *dhikr* when he said that both congregational *dhikr* and *dhikr* in *sirr* is a good practice. Some may argue that when al-Shafi'e prefers *dhikr* in *sirr* over *dhikr* in *jahr*, his position is no different from those who oppose *dhikr* in *jahr* and only allow *dhikr* in *sirr*. This statement is, however, couldn't be further from the truth. When al-Shafi'e commented on this issue, he begins his comment by affirming that both *dhikr* in *jahr* and *sirr* is a good practice. He then continues to explain that he prefers both *Imam* and *ma'mum* to do *dhikr* in *sirr* unless they need to learn from him how to do *dhikr*. It is clear from this statement that, even though Imam al-Shafi'e prefers *dhikr* in *sirr* over *dhikr* in *jahr*, but he still allows both types of *dhikr* be it in *jahr* or *sirr*. This position is very different from those who oppose the congregational *dhikr* and only allow *dhikr* in *sirr*.

This position is further supported by Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalani in which he commented that the virtues of doing congregational *dhikr* are not only granted to those who participate but also extended to those who are present at the same place without participating

in the congregation. This is to show the virtues and the advantages of the congregational *dhikr* practice in which it is a blessing for all of the people who are present during the event⁴⁵.

Al-Suyuti, when commenting on the issue of congregational *dhikr* in his writing,⁴⁶ mentioned that there are almost 25 *abadith* related to it. All of these *abadith* indicate that the practice of congregational *dhikr* is recommended and not *bid'ah makruhah*. Those who claimed that the practice of congregational *dhikr* is *bid'ah* based on *athar* of Ibn Mas'ud, presuming that it is valid, is clearly in contradiction to the 25 authentic *abadith* mentioned earlier which constitute a very solid proof and authority for the practice of congregational *dhikr*⁴⁷.

Lastly, al-Shawkani⁴⁸ when commenting on the issue of gathering in the mosque or the house of *masyit* in some Muslim countries stated that despite the absence of precedent from Quran and *Sunnah* for this gathering, as long as it is organised for the purpose of remembering Allah (*s.w.t.*) and there is not element of *ma'siyah* in it, undoubtedly it is allowed in Islam. He further stated that anyone who claims that the gathering which is free from any sinful activity as *bid'ah* has erred. *Bid'ah* is something that is innovated in the religion while this practice is obviously has nothing to do with it⁴⁹.

Based on the above discussion which consist of various Quranic verse, *abadith* of the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) and numerous opinions of Muslim scholars, it can be concluded that, the scholars in the first group relied on various sources of Islamic law such as Quran, various *hadith* of the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) as mentioned by al-Suyuti, as well as understand the *hadith* from *usul fiqh* point of view. They also adopt various rules of interpretation which has led to a very flexible *hukm* (ruling) which will be relevant for many years to come.

THE OPPOSITION OF CONGREGATIONAL *DHIKR*

Moving on to the second group which consists of some scholars from Hanafiyyah⁵⁰, Malikiyyah⁵¹ and Salafiyyah⁵² who are of the opinion that the practice of congregational *dhikr* is *bid'ah makruhah*

or *bid'ah muharramah*. Among Hanafiyyah scholars who opined that congregational *dhikr* is *bid'ah makruhah* is al-Khadimi⁵³. Among Malikiyyah scholars who opined congregational *dhikr* is *bid'ah makruhah* is al-Imam al-Hattab⁵⁴, al- 'Allamah 'Alaysh⁵⁵, Ibn al-Hajj⁵⁶, al-Imam al-Dardir⁵⁷ and al- 'Allamah al- Dasuqi⁵⁸. Among *Salafiyyah* scholars who opined that congregational *dhikr* is *bid'ah muharramah* are Shaykh ibn Baz⁵⁹ and Shaykh ibn Uthaymin⁶⁰.

This second group of scholars based their opinion on several authorities. Firstly, there is Quranic verse that says: “*Call on your Lord with humility and in private: for Allah loves not those who trespass beyond bounds*”.⁶¹ Based on this Quranic verse, it is not allowed and it is not preferable to call Allah (*s.w.t.*) in any type of *'ibadah* which includes the practice of *dhikr* in a loud manner. Allah (*s.w.t.*) is not deaf and there is no need for such loud chanting as it would amount to bad *adab* to Allah (*s.w.t.*). Secondly, there is a *hadith* related to the prohibition of introducing innovation in the matter of *'ibadah* that has been narrated by Jabir Ibn Abdillah, in which the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) said in his *khutbah*: “*Whomsoever Allah guides, none can lead him astray, and whomsoever Allah sends astray, none can guide. The truest of word is the Book of Allah and best of guidance is the guidance of Muhammad. The worst of things are those that are newly invented; every newly invented thing is an innovation and every innovation is going astray, and every going- astray is in the Fire*”.⁶²

It can be understood from the above *hadith* that, the act of innovation in the matter of religion, in particular, the matter related with *'ibadah*, is forbidden as it would tantamount to adding and making up the matter of *'ibadah* that has been completed by Allah (*s.w.t.*) and His Messenger. Furthermore, there is no valid *hadith* or *athar* that suggests the congregational *dhikr* had taken place during the period of *Salaf al-Salih* except the *hadith* of Ibn 'Abbas where it says that Ibn 'Abbas will know that the obligatory prayer has ended when he heard the *dhikr*⁶³. However, it must be noted that the congregational *dhikr* in the *hadith* of Ibn 'Abbas has occurred during the earlier period of Islam where the Prophet Muhammad

(*s.a.w.*) wanted to teach the companion how to do *dhikr* after prayer. After that, the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) has never repeated it for the rest of his life. This shows that collective *dhikr* that has been done by the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) and his Companions only once and after that, they did the *dhikr* individually. Thus, continuously doing collective *dhikr* after the obligatory prayer is actually introducing a new set of practice that has never been done by the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) and his Companions. Thus, it could be considered as innovating new practice of '*ibadah*. This is the main reason why it is considered as *bid'ah makruhah* or *bid'ah muharramah*.

Secondly, there is a *hadith* which has been relied upon by those who allow the practice of congregational *dhikr*, which was narrated by Abu Ma'bad from Ibn 'Abbas in which he said: "*Narrated Abu Ma'bad, the freed slave of Ibn 'Abbas: Ibn Abbas (r.a.) told me. In the lifetime of the Prophet Muhammad (s.a.w.) it was the custom to remember Allah (Dhikr) by glorifying, praising and magnifying Allah aloud after the compulsory congregational Salat (prayers). Ibn 'Abbas further said: when I heard the dhikr, I would learn that the compulsory congregational Salat had ended.*"⁶⁴ It is obvious from the above *hadith* that congregational *dhikr* did take place during the period of the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*). However, it must be stressed that the event where the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) and his Companions did collective *dhikr* with loud voice only occurred once during the early period of Islam. Once the companions had learned the *dhikr* after prayer, the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) had stopped doing it at all. Therefore, the current practice of congregational *dhikr* after the obligatory prayer in Muslim community is clearly in contradiction to the *hadith* of Ibn 'Abbas. The Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) has omitted this congregational *dhikr*, and this omission amounted to the concept of *Sunnah al-Tarkiyah*. No companion has ever tried to repeat this congregational *dhikr* after that, and this argument brings the discussion to the next significant authority, which is the prohibition to do congregational *dhikr*.

Thirdly, there is an *athar*⁶⁵ of Ibn Mas'ud that was narrated by

'al- Hakam Ibn Mubarak that prohibits those who sit and join congregational *dhikr*: *"We used to sit at the door of 'Abdullah Ibn Mas'ud before the Morning Prayer, so that when he came out, we would be able to walk with him to the mosque. So, Abu Musa al-Asha'ari came to us, so he said, Has Abu 'Abd al- Rahman come out yet? So, we said, No. So, he sat with us until he came out. So, when he came out, all of us stood up with him. So, Abu Musa said to him, O Abu 'Abd al- Rahman, verily I saw in the mosque a detestable action that I hated, but I did not see, and the praise is for Allah, anything except good. He said, so what was it? He said, if you live, you will see it. I saw in the mosque, a people sitting in circles, waiting for the Prayer. There was a man in every circle, and in their hands were pebbles, so he would say: Say Allahu Akbar (Allah is Greater) one hundred times, so they would say it one hundred times. So, he would say: Say Alhamdulillah (the praise is for Allah) one hundred times, so they would say it one hundred times. And he would say: Say Subhanallah (Free is Allah from all imperfection) one hundred times, so they would say it one hundred times. He said, so what did you say to them? He said, I did not say to them anything, I waited for your command. He said, would that you had ordered them to count up their evil deeds, and assured them that nothing from their evil deeds would be lost! Then he went, and we went with him, until he came upon the circles of these people. So, he stood over them and said, what is this that I see you doing? They said, O Abu 'Abd al- Rahman, these are pebbles upon which we count the takbir, tablil, and tasbih. He said, then count up your evil deeds, and I assure you that nothing from your evil deeds will be lost. Woe to you O Ummah of Muhammad! How quickly you rush to destruction! These are the Companions of your Prophet Muhammad (s.a.w.) who are abundant. And these are his clothes that have not yet decayed, and his bowl that is still unbroken. By Him in Whose Hand my soul is, either you are upon the religion better guided than the Ummah of Muhammad, or you are opening the door to misguidance. They said, By Allah O Abu 'Abd al- Rahman, we did not intend anything except good. He said, and how many people intend good yet do not achieve it? Verily the Messenger informed us: Verily there will be a people reciting the Quran, yet it will not pass beyond their throats. By Allah I do not know, perhaps most of*

them are from amongst you. Then he left them. So 'Amr Ibn Salamah said: We saw the great majority of these people fight against us upon the day of al- Nahrwan along with the Khawarij'.⁶⁶ In this *athar*, it seems that Ibn Mas'ud considered the act of the companion to sit and join in congregational *dhikr* as an opening the door to misguidance. And this prohibition by Ibn Mas'ud is a very clear indication that the practice of doing *dhikr* collectively is an act of innovation that has never been preceded by the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) and his Companions.

Another argument that can be used to strengthen the previous authority is the *hadith* narrated by Abu Hurayrah (*r.a.*)⁶⁷. When the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) mentioned the word "*Majalis al- Dhikr*", it refers to "*Majalis al- 'Ilm*", i.e., academic discussion where the discussion on the matter of *halal* and *haram* in Islam is taken place. Those who understood *Majalis al- 'Ilm* as congregational *dhikr* has erred in their interpretation.⁶⁸

Fifthly, in doing congregational *dhikr*, there are a lot of irregular practices contradicted to the principle of Islam. For instance, there will be element of dancing, jamming or distorting of certain Quranic verses. There is also the element of break apart of certain words which violate the grammatical system of Quran by elongated that particular way in a very specific way or order⁶⁹. These irregularities have taken place in many congregational *dhikrs* happening nowadays and this ill-practice must be stopped from spreading in Muslim community.

Lastly, considering all of the previous arguments, there is one final argument that will be resorted to by those who opposed the practice of congregational *dhikr* which is *sadd dhari'ah* (blocking the means). Having established that continuously doing congregational *dhikr* following one leader is a *bid'ah* act that has never been practised by the Prophet Muhammad and his companion, then this practice must be stopped and prohibited at all cost⁷⁰. Otherwise, there will be people who misunderstood this practice as *Sunnah* of the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*).

There are several scholars who oppose the practice of collective *dhikr*. Among them were al-Hattab⁷¹, 'Alaysh, Ibn al-Hajj⁷² and

al-Khadimi who opined that congregational recitation of Quran and congregational *dhikr* are *bid'ah makruhah*⁷³. 'Alaysh⁷⁴ and al-Khadimi⁷⁵ further elaborated that the act of reciting Quran collectively will lead to the omission of what has been commanded by Allah (*s.w.t.*) which is listening to the recitation. This has been stated clearly in *Surah al-A'raf* that requires Muslims to pay attention and listen to the Quran being recited⁷⁶. However, al-Dardir and al-Dasuqi further explained that, the reason why they opined the practice of congregational *dhikr* as *bid'ah makruhah* only if it is intended to liken the congregational *dhikr* to the *masnunat al-Shar'iyyah* (other recommended practice) command by *Shara'*, otherwise it is considered as *mustahabb* (recommended).⁷⁷

Ibn Uthaymin⁷⁸ and Ibn Baz⁷⁹ when commenting on the issue of congregational *dhikr* said that the practice of *dhikr* after the prayer has been misunderstood by many people. During the period of the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*), it was done for the purpose of teaching of the companion and it was done with a lower voice to avoid disturbance to other people who are praying and they are doing it individually. However, in today's situation, people do the congregational *dhikr* after prayer until it disturbs other people who are still praying. And there is no obligation to teach the public since it is known to the public and they have been accustomed to the *dhikr* practised by the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) and his companion. The practice of people nowadays in doing congregational *dhikr* aloud is clearly a *bid'ah* (innovation) that has never been practised by the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) and his Companions⁸⁰. Ibn Baz further added that the practice after obligatory prayer must be done individually as shown by the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) and his Companions⁸¹.

After perusing all of the authorities, scholar's opinion and arguments by the second group, it shows that, those who oppose the practice of congregational *dhikr* especially *Salafi* doctrine relied heavily on of Quran and *Sunnah*. They also adopt a strictly literal understanding of *hadith* related to *bid'ah* where they considered the act of doing *dhikr* collectively after every obligatory prayer as a

new innovation that has never taken place during the period of Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) and his Companions. This group also understands *Majalis al- Dhikr* in the previous *hadith* as an academic discussion rather than collective *dhikr*. Last but not least, they also recognise the concept of *al- Tark* (omission) as one of the valid sources of Islamic law in which they opine that the congregational *dhikr* mentioned in *hadith* of Ibn Abbas only happened once for the purpose of teaching the companions about *dhikr*. This congregational *dhikr* has never taken place again after that event which amounted to the omission of the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*). Finally, they conclude their argument with the concept of *sadd dhari'ah* in prohibiting and putting a stop to the practice of congregational *dhikr* which is considered as *bid'ah* act.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the methodology of *ijtihad* of the scholar from the first group depicts a serious involvement of human reason. This is obvious from the use of various sources of Islamic law which include primary and secondary sources rather than Quran and *sunnah* per se. This can be seen very clearly when they use secondary sources of Islamic law such *istihsan*, *istishab*, *maslahah mursalah*, that require a lot of logical deduction as well as logical understanding in deducing legal rule from not only Quran and *Sunnah* but also other circumstantial evidence. The employment of various *turuq* of *istinbat* in understanding *naqli* authorities just to see a probable solution from multiple angles also is proof that human reasoning has a vital role in the *ijtihad* process. However, it must be noted that, despite its huge role in the *ijtihad* process, it is still bound by certain principle of divine origin and certain established guidelines that will steer human reasoning into the most correct way of *ijtihad* in the pursuit of minimising the chance of committing error in the process of rule-making.

The scholars of the second group, on the other hand, appear to be limiting the involvement of human reasoning in their *ijtihad* methodology. The application of literal approach in Quran and *Sunnah* in particular shows that they prefer to use less human

reasoning and refuse to dig deeper in searching or rather exploring the new ruling by adopting multiple rules of interpretation as well as look into the vast collection of Islamic law sources. In other words, the human mind is prone to commit mistake and can easily be corrupted. Therefore, by limiting its role in the *ijtihad* process, it will also reduce the chance of making error in the final outcome. Another distinct feature of this group is resorting to the concept of *al- Tark* (omission) in the process of rule-making. They are of the opinion that, by having this concept, it will again, limit the involvement of human mind in exercising *ijtihad* by simply looking at the *matan* of the *hadith* of the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*), and straight away decide that if a practice did not take place during the life of Prophet and his companion, then, that particular practice or act shall be deemed as innovation. And based on the *hadith* of Jabir, this innovation would tantamount to creating a new tradition in the matter of religion which is strictly prohibited in Islam. This principle in particular, is based on the benevolent intention of preserving the religion from any kind of innovation and retaining their main goal of reducing human intervention in the rule-making process.

The differences in methodology of *ijtihad* are a form of diversity in Islamic scholarship that if it is used properly, it will be beneficial to Muslim *ummah*. The arguments from both sides are based from the same Quran and *Sunnah*, however, the way they evaluate and understand these authorities will determine the outcome of certain practices. It must be emphasized that, in Islam, the differences in the matter of *'aqidah* is not allowed. However, when it comes to the matter of *'ibadah*, the differences of opinion are allowed and this is what makes Islamic scholarship more beautiful, colourful and diversified. These differences, however, must be handled with respect and with utmost care so that it will not lead to disunity and fight among Muslim community in Malaysia.

Among the example shown by previous scholars in dealing with the differences in methodology of *ijtihad* is the act of al-Shafi'e in omitting the recitation of *qunut* when he performed *salat* not far from the tomb of Abu Hanifah. When al- Shafi'e became

Imam in the *salat*, the *ma'mum* surprised he doesn't recite *qunut*⁸². He explained that he wants to observe the *adab* towards the teacher of his teacher i.e. Abu Hanifah. In another event, Ahmad ibn Hanbal is known for his opinion that nosebleed and cupping will nullify *wudu*'. Ahmad ibn Hanbal was asked if blood is coming out from *Imam* and he doesn't renew his *wudu*' before becoming *Imam* in *salat* again, will you pray behind him? How I am not performing *salat* behind *Imam* Malik and Sa'ied Ibn al- Musayyib? Since both of them opined that cupping and nosebleed will not nullify the *wudu*'⁸³. Last but not least, Ibn Taymiyyah in his *fatawa* opined that if the *Imam* thinks that the *witr* should be done separately. And the *ma'mum* thinks that *witr* should be done like *Maghrib*, and he agrees to do that as to create harmony, that is better as the Prophet Muhammad (*s.a.w.*) said to 'Aishah: "Were it not that your people have only recently left *Jahiliyyah* behind, I would have razed the *Ka'bah* to the ground and rebuilt it with two doors, one through which the people might enter and one through which they might exit". But he decided not to do that which was better, lest it put the people off⁸⁴.

The above events are among the examples of how previous Muslim scholars deal with the differences of opinion which not only show their tolerance toward each other but also their compassion in preserving the unity of the *ummah* by celebrating various opinions on certain issues. Muslim community need to follow these examples in order to have a quality intellectual discussion while maintaining the peace and unity of the *ummah*.

Notes

- 1 Quran (Ali- 'Imran) 3: 191 (Translation: Men who celebrate the praises of Allah, standing, sitting, and lying down on their sides, and contemplate the (wonders of) creation in the heavens and the earth, (With the thought): "Our Lord! not for naught Hast Thou created (all) this! Glory to Thee! Give us salvation from the penalty of the Fire); Quran (al- Jumu'ah) 62: 9 (Translation: through the land, and seek of the Bounty of Allah: and celebrate the Praises of Allah often (and without stint): that ye may prosper).
- 2 Muhammad ibn Isma'il al- Bukhari, The Translation of the Meanings of

- Sahih al- Bukhari; Arabic- English, trans. Muhammad Muhsin Khan (Riyad: Dar al- Salam, 1997) Vol. 8, Hadith 6465: 258.
- 3 Abu Qani'ah, Abu Zahidah, *Senjata Shari'ah: Pakaian Ahli Sunnah wal Jama'ah Memawangkan Khurafat dan Muftadi'ah*, (Pattani: Matba'ah Halabi, 1953), 31.
 - 4 Abu Bakar al- Ashaari, *Jawahir al- Bukhari*, (Pulau Pinang: Persama Press, 1954), Vol. 3, 112- 113.
 - 5 K.H. Sirajuddin Abbas, *40 Masalah Agama*, (Jakarta: Pustaka Tarbiyah Baru, 2013).
 - 6 Mohd Asri Zainul Abidin, *Bidaah Hasanah: Istilah Yang Disalah Fahami*, (Johor: Perniagaan Jahabersa, 2018), 8.
 - 7 Muhadir Jol, *Persoalan Khilafiyah & Penjelasan Ulama: Inilah Jawapannya*, (Kuala Lumpur: Mawleed Publisher, 2009), 579- 602.
 - 8 See Enakmen Mufti dan Fatwa (Kedah Darul Aman) 2008; Fatwa Mengenai Pembid'ahan kepada Amalan- amalan Ahli Sunnah wal Jamaah di Negeri Kedah Darul Aman, No. 720.
 - 9 See Enakmen Pentadbiran Agama Islam (Perak) 2004; Fatwa Mengenai Pencegahan Menyebarkan Aliran dan Dakya Wahabiah di Negeri Perak Darul Ridzuan, no. 3565.
 - 10 Enakmen Pentadbiran Agama Islam (Negeri Selangor) 2003; Fatwa Menangani Persoalan Bid'ah dalam Masalah Ikhtilaf/ Khilaf Perkara Furu'.
 - 11 See Fatwa berkaitan dengan Aliran dan Dakwah Wahhabiah.
 - 12 See Fatwa' Tegahan dan Larangan Menyebarkan Ajaran Salafiah @ Wahabiah dan Seumpamanya di Negeri Pahang; see Fatwa: Menangani Persoalan Bid'ah dalam Masalah Ikhtilaf' Khilaf Furu' 2016.
 - 13 Enakmen Pentadbiran Agama Islam (Negeri Johor) 2003.
 - 14 See Fatwa Mufti Kerajaan Johor: Perkara Mengenai Kaum Muda- Wahhabi- dan Musuh- musuh Islam.
 - 15 Sayf ibn 'Ali al- 'Asri, al- Bid'ah al- Idafiyyah; Dirasah Ta'siliyyah Tatbiqiyah, (Oman: Dar al- Fath, 2013), 412.
 - 16 Among Hanafiyyah scholars who opined the practice of congregational dhikr is mustahab are Imam Khayr al- Din al- Ramli, Imam Mulla 'Ali Qari, Imam 'Abd al- Haqq al- Dahlawi and Imam al- Lakanawi.

- 17 Among Malikiyyah scholars who opined that congregational dhikr is mustahab are Imam Malik Ibn Anas himself, Imam Ibn Naji al- Tanukhi and al- 'Allamah al- Nafrawi.
- 18 Among Shafi'eyyah scholars who agree with the opinion of Jumhur in saying congregational dhikr is mustahab are Imam al- Nawawi, Shaykh al- Islam Zakariyya al- Ansari and Imam Khatib al- Sharbini.
- 19 Among Hanabilah scholars who opined congregational is mustahabb are Shaykh al- Islam Taqi al-Din ibn Taimiyyah and al- 'Allamah Mansur Ibn Yunus al- Buhuti al- Hanbali.
- 20 Muhammad 'Abd al- Hayy al- Laknawi, Sibahat al- Fikr fi al- Jahr bi al- Dhikr, (Qaherah: Dar al- Salam, 2009), 31.
- 21 'Ali ibn Sultan Muhammad Mulla Qari, Mirqat al- Mafatih Sharh Mishkat al- Masabih, (Beirut: Dar al- Fikr, 2002), Vol. 5, 145.
- 22 Muhammad Ibrahim Saqar, Nazzarat fi Risalat al- Ma'thurat, 87- 88.
- 23 Malik Ibn Anas, al- Muwatta', Hadith 205: 404.
- 24 Qasim ibn 'Isa Naji, Sharh Ibn Najjal- Tanuji 'ala Matn al- Risalah, (Beirut: Dar al- Kutub al- 'Ilmiyyah, 2007), Vol. 1, 241.
- 25 Ahmad ibn Ghanim Al- Nafrawi, al- Fawakih al- Dawani 'ala Risalah ibn Abi Zayd al- Qayruwani, (Beirut: Dar al- Fikr, 1994), Vol. 1, 273.
- 26 Yahya ibn Sharaf al- Nawawi, al- Majmu' Sharh al- Muhaddhab, (Beirut: Dar al- Fikr, n.d.), Vol. 2, 189.
- 27 Zakariyya ibn Muhammad al- Ansari, Asna al- Matalib fi Sharh Rawd al- Talib, (Qaherah: Dar al- Kitab al- Islami, n.d.) Vol. 4, 344.
- 28 Muhammad al- Khatib al- Sharbini, Mughni al- Muhtaj ila Ma'rifat Ma'ani Alfaz al- Minhaj, (Beirut: Dar al- kutub al- 'Ilmiyyah, 1994), Vol. 6, 348.
- 29 Taqi al- Din Ibn Taymiyyah, al- Fatawa al- Kubra Li al- Imam al- 'Allamah Taqi al- Din Ibn Taymiyyah, (Beirut: Dar al- Kutub al- 'Ilmiyyah, 1987), Vol. 5, 344.
- 30 Mansur ibn Yunus al- Buhuti, Sharh Muntaha al- Iradat Daqa'iq Uli al- Nuha li al- Sharh al- Muntaha, (Beirut: Muassasah al- Risalah, 2005), Vol. 1, 528.
- 31 'Abdullah Yusuf Ali, The Holy Quran; Text and Translation, (Ali- 'Imran)

298 / Khairul Fahmi Jamaludin, Mohamad Asmadi Abdullah, Mohamad Sabri Zakaria and Afridah Abas

- 3: 191, (Kuala Lumpur: Islamic Book Trust, 2007), 83.
- 32 'Abdullah Yusuf Ali, The Holy Quran, (al- Jumu'ah) 62: 9, 706.
- 33 Isma'il Ibn 'Umar Ibn Kathir, al- Quran al- 'Azim, (Beirut: Dar Ibn Hazm, 2000), Surah al- Jumu'ah; 62, 1875.
- 34 'Abd al- Rahman ibn Nasir al- Sa'adi, Tafsir al- Sa'adi: Taysir al- Karim al- Rahman fi Tafsir Kalam al- Manan, (Beirut: Dar al- Salam wa al- Tawzi', 2002), Surah al- Jumu'ah: 62, 1018.
- 35 Muhammad ibn Isma'il, The Translation of the Meanings...., Vol. 8, Hadith 6408: 229- 230.
- 36 Muhammad Ibn 'Ali al- Shawkani, al- Fath al- Rabbani min Fatawa al- Imam al- Shawkani, (Yaman: Maktabah al- Jayl al- Jadid, n.d.), Vol. 12, 5945- 5946.
- 37 Muhammad ibn Isma'il, The Translation of the Meanings...., Vol. 8, Hadith 6408: 229- 230.
- 38 Sahih al- Bukhari, Kitab al- Adhan, Vol. 1, Hadith 841: 465.
- 39 Muslim ibn Hajjaj, English Translation of Sahih Muslim, (Riyad: Dar al- Salam, 2007), Vol. 7, Kitab al- Dhikr wa al- Du'a wa al- Tawbah wa al- Istighfar, Hadith 6857: 75.
- 40 Sayf ibn Ali Al- 'Asri, al- Bid'ah al- Idafiyyah Dirasah Ta'siliyyah Tambiqiyyah, (Amman: Dar al- Fath Li Dirasat wa al- Nashr, 434.
- 41 Muhammad ibn Al- Hakim al- Naysaburi, al- Mustadrak 'ala al- Sahihayn, Li al- Hakim, (Qaherah: Dar al- Haramayn Li al- Tiba'ah wa al- Nashr wa al- Tawzi', 1997), Vol. 1, Hadith 1896: 685; Ahmad Ibn Muhammad Ibn Hanbal, al- Musnad li al- Imam Ahmad, Vol. 13, Hadith 17057: 271 (This hadith its isnad is hasan according to Imam Ahmad, al- Hakim and Duhaym).
- 42 Taqial- Din Ahmad ibn Taimiyyah, al- Fatawa al- Kubra Li Ibn Taimiyyah, (Beirut: Dar al- Kutub al- 'Ilmiyyah, 1987), Vol. 2, Kitab al- Dhikr wa al- Du'a, 384.
- 43 Al- Nawawi (1930) Sharah Sahih Muslim, Matba'ah al- Misriyyah bi al- Azhar, Vol. 17, Fadl Majalis al- Dhikr, 15.
- 44 Taqi al- Din, Vol. 2, 384.45 Muhammad ibn Hajar al- 'Asqalani, Fath al- Bari Bi Sharh Sahih al- Bukhari, Dar al- Ma'rifah, Lubnan, Vol. 11, 213.
- 46 Jalal al- Din al- Suyumi, al- Hawi Li al- Fatawa Li al- Suyumi: Fatawa al-

Congregational Dhikr After Salat: An Islamic Jurisprudential... / 299

Hadithiyyah, (Beirut: Dar al- Kutub al- 'Ilmiyyah, 2000), 389- 393; see also Jalal al- Din al- Suyumi, *Natijat al- Fikr fi al- Jahri bi al- Dhikr*, 1-9; http://data.nur.nu/Kutub/Arabic/Suyuti_Writings/Suyuti_NatijatulFikr-fil-jahr-bil-dhikr.pdf.

47 Ibid, 394.

48 Muhammad ibn 'Ali al- Shawkani, *Rasa'il al- Salafiyyah fi Ihya' Sunnah*

Khayr al- Barriyyah: al- Risalah al- Rabi'ah; *Irshad al- Sa'il Ila Dala'il al- Masa'il*, (Beirut: Dar al- Kitab al- 'Arabi, 1994), 83-84.

49 Ibid, 84- 85.

50 Among Hanafiyyah scholars who opined congregational dhikr is bid'ah makruhah is al- Khadimi.

51 Among Malikiyyah scholars who opined congregational dhikr is bid'ah makruhah is Imam Malik Ibn Anas, al- Imam al- Hattabi, al- 'Allamah 'Alaysh, Ibn al- Hajj, al- Imam al-Dardir and al- 'Allamah al- Dasuqi.

52 Among Salafiyyah scholars who opined that congregational dhikr is bid'ah are Shaykh ibn Baz and Shaykh ibn 'Uthaymin. Salafiyyah is a group that known for their call to return to Quran, *sunnah* and the practice of *Salaf al- Salih*.

53 Muhammad ibn Mustafa al- Khadimi, al- Bariqat al- Mahmudiyyah fi Sharh al- Tariqat al- Muhammadiyyah, (Beirut: Dar al- Kutub al- 'Ilmiyyah, 2011), 292- 293.

54 Muhammad Ibn Muhammad al- Hammab, *Mawahib al- Jalil fi Sharh Mukhtasar al- Shaykh al- Khalil*, (Beirut: Dur al- Fikr, 1992), Vol. 2, 64.

55 Muhammad 'Alaysh, *Sharh Manh al- Jalil 'ala Mukhtasar al- 'Allamah Khalil*, (Beirut: Dar al- Fikr, 1984), Vol. 1, 333- 334.

56 Muhammad ibn Muhammad al- Hajj, al- *Madkhal Ila Tanmiyyat al- A'mal bi Tahsin al- Niyyat wa al- Tanbih 'ala Ba'd al- Bid' wa al- 'Awa'id Allati Intahalat wa Bayan Shana'aha*, (Qaherah: Dar al- Turath, n.d.), Vol. 4, 221.

57 Muhammad ibn Ahmad al- Dasuqi, *Hasyiah al- Dasuqi 'ala Sharh al- Kabir* (Dimashq: Dar al- Fikr, 2005.), Vol. 1, 484.

58 Ibid.

59 'Abd al 'Aziz ibn Baz, *Majmu' Fatawa wa Maqalat Mutanawwi'ah*, (Riyad:

- Dar al- Qasim, 1999), Vol. 11, 1.
- 60 Muhammad ibn Salih, *Majmu' al- Fatawa wa Rasa'il*, (Riyad: Dar al- Waman Li al- Nashr, 1986), Vol. 13, 248- 253.
- 61 'Abdullah Yusuf 'Ali, *The Holy Quran; Text and Translation*, (al- 'Araf), 7: 55, (Kuala Lumpur: Islamic Book Trust, 2007), 176.
- 62 Ahmad ibn Shu'ayb al- Nasa'i, *English Translation of Sunan al- Nasa'i*, trans. Nasiruddin al- Khattab (Riyad: Dar al- Salam, 2007) *Kitab Salat al- 'Adayn*, Vol. 2, Hadith 1579: 438- 439.
- 63 *Sahih al- Bukhari*, Vol.1, *Kitab al- Adhan*, Hadith 841: 465.
- 64 *Ibid.*
- 65 In another narration by 'Abd al- Razzaq al- San'ani, *Musannaf 'Abd al- Razzaq* (Beirut: al- Maktab al- Islami, 1983) Vol. 3, *Kitab al- Jum'ah*, Bab *Dhikr al- Qisas*, Hadith 5409, 221-222. by Sulayman ibn Ahmad al- Tabarani, *al- Mu'jam al- Kabir Li Tabarani: Musnad 'Abdullah Ibn Mas'ud al- Hadhali*, (Qaherah: Maktabah Ibn Taimiyyah, n.d.), Vol. 9, Bab al- 'Ayn, *Man Ismuhu 'Abdullah, 'Abdullah ibn Mas'ud al- Hadhali*, Hadith 8630:134, Takhrij hadith: https://m-almored.blogspot.com/2014/07/blog-post_18.html.
- 66 'Abdullah ibn 'Abd al- Rahman Al- Darimi, *Kitab al- Musnad al- Jami' Li Abu Muhammad 'Abdillah Ibn 'Abd al- Rahman al – Fadl al- Darimi*, (Beirut: Dar al- Basha'ir al- Islamiyyah, 2013) *Kitab al- 'Ilm*, Hadith 222: 142.
- 67 *Sahih Al- Bukhari*, Vol.8, *Kitab al- Da'awat*, Hadith 6408: 229- 230.
- 68 Sayf 'Ali, *al- Bid'ah al- Idafiyyah*, 428.
- 69 *Ibid.*
- 70 Muhammad ibn Salih al- 'Uthaymin, *Majmu' al- Fatawa wa Rasa'il Li Shaykh Muhammad Salih Ibn 'Uthaymin*, (Riyad: Dar al- Waman Li al- Nashr, 1986), Vol. 13, 248- 253.
- 71 Muhammad Ibn Muhammad al- Hammab, *Mawahib al- Jalil fi Sharh Mukhtasar al- Shaykh al- Khalil*, (Beirut: Dar al- Fikr, 1992), Vol. 2, 64.
- 72 Muhammad ibn Muhammad al- Hajj, *al- Madkhal Ila Tanmiyyat al- 'Amal bi Tahsin al- Niyyat wa al- Tanbih 'Ala Ba'dal- Bid' wa al- 'Awa'id* (Qaherah: Dar al- Turath, n.d.), Vol. 4, 221.
- 73 Muhammad ibn Muhammad al- Hajj, *al- Madkhal Ila Tanmiyyat al-*

Congregational Dhikr After Salat: An Islamic Jurisprudential... / 301

ʿAmal bi Tahsin al- Niyyat, 72-73; see also Muhammad Ibn Muhammad al- Hammab, *Mawahib al- Jalil fi Sharī*, Vol. 2, 64.

- 74 Ibid.
- 75 Muhammad ibn Mustafa al- Khadimi, *al- Bariqat al- Mahmudiyah fi Sharh al- Tariqat al- Muhammadiyyah*, (Beirut: Dar al- Kutub al- ʿIlmiyyah, 2011), 292- 293.
- 76 Quran (al- Aʿraf) 7: 204; see ʿAbdullah Yusuf ʿAli the Holy Quran: Text and Translation, 198; when the Quran is read, listen to it with attention, and hold your peace; that you may receive Mercy.
- 77 Muhammad ibn Ahmad al- Dasuqi, *Hasyiah al- Dasuqi ʿAla Sharh al- Kabir*, (Dimashq: Dar al- Fikr, 2005.), Vol. 1, 484.
- 78 Muhammad ibn Salih, *Majmuʿ al- Fatawa wa Rasaʿil*, (Riyad: Dar al- Waman Li al- Nashr, 1986), Vol. 13, 248- 253.
- 79 ʿAbd al ʿAziz ibn Baz, *Majmuʿ Fatawa wa Maqalat Mutanawwiʿah*, (Riyadh: Dar al- Qasim, 1999), Vol. 11, 1.
- 80 Muhammad Ibn Salih, *Majmuʿ al- Fatawa*, Vol. 13, pp. 248- 253.
- 81 ʿAbd al- ʿAziz, Vol. 11, 1.
- 82 Muhammad ʿAnd al- Rahman al- Marʿashali. *Al- Khilaf Yamnaʿ al- Ikhtilaf*, (Beirut: Dar al- Nafaʿis, 2009), 324.
- 83 Ibid.
- 84 Taqi al- Din Ibn Taymiyyah, *al- Fatawa al- Kubra Li al- Imam al- ʿAllamah Taqi al- Din Ibn Taymiyyah*, (Beirut: Dar al- Kutub al- ʿIlmiyyah, 1987), Vol. 2, 117- 118.



This document was created with the Win2PDF "print to PDF" printer available at <http://www.win2pdf.com>

This version of Win2PDF 10 is for evaluation and non-commercial use only.

This page will not be added after purchasing Win2PDF.

<http://www.win2pdf.com/purchase/>