

Industry Outputs Arising from the Implementation of the Medium-Term Fiscal Strategy 2013-2016 for the Greek Economy

MANOLIS BOUSOUNIS* & CHARALAMPOS ECONOMIDIS**

The aim of this paper is to estimate the output vector of the Greek economy for the year 2015 based on the implementation of the Medium-Term Fiscal Strategy 2013-2016, and to make a comparative presentation of the output vectors for the years 2010 and 2015. The 2015 output vector is estimated using two different estimating methods, the first based on the Symmetric Input-Output Table (SIOT) and the second on the Supply and Use Table (SUT). The results show an increase in output of most industries and changes in the composition of sectoral outputs of the Greek economy. However, the available empirical evidence is in stark contrast to these estimates.

INTRODUCTION

In the Medium-Term Fiscal Strategy 2013-2016 (MTFS 2013-2016) for the Greek economy, a number of assumptions are made relating to the size of imports, exports, private consumption, government consumption and total investment for the period in question, which may be considered as constituting final demand for each respective year. Using data from MTFS 2013-2016, the aim of this paper is to estimate the output vector of the Greek economy for the year 2015.¹ A comparison is then made between the output vectors for 2010 and 2015, not only for the economy as a whole but also in terms of changes in output at an industry level. To assess the possibility of different results, the 2015 output vector is estimated using two different methods or estimations, the first based on the Symmetric Input-Output Table (SIOT) and the second on the Supply and Use Table (SUT) (see Eurostat, 2008; Miller and Blair, 2009).

The purpose of these estimates is to enable an assessment of the changes in the output of industries which would take place in the Greek

* Department of Public Administration, Panteion University, Athens, Greece.

** Corresponding author. Department of Public Administration, Panteion University, Athens, Greece, *E-mail:* checonom@panteion.gr

economy if MTFS 2013-2016 was implemented. As evidenced by the relevant literature, this assessment does not appear to have been made by the institutional authorities (see Hellenic Republic Ministry of Finance, 2012; Bank of Greece, 2012).

The remainder of the paper is structured as follows. Section 2 describes the methodological approach adopted. Section 3 presents and evaluates the results. Finally, Section 4 concludes.

METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH

The estimation of the 2015 output vector is based on the technical characteristics of the input-output table for 2010. More specifically, we used the data on technical coefficients which derive from the 2010 table and in so doing we assume that technology has not changed between 2010 and 2015.² Furthermore, the MTFS 2013-2016 data were treated as exogenously given and used to calculate the final demand vector for 2015. As is well known, final demand in the input-output table that we use comprises private consumption (Households and Non-Profit Institutions Serving Households), government consumption, total investment, exports and imports of goods and services. Each of these components represents a share (percentage) of final demand in the input-output table for 2010, and this share is assumed to remain constant for all the years of our analysis.

In Table 1 we show the data pertaining to MTFS 2013-2016.³ On the basis of these changes, we calculate the main aggregate variables of the Greek economy, and the figures are displayed in Table 2 (using the year 2012 as our base year).

Table 1
Macroeconomic data of MTFS 2013-2016

Main aggregates of the Greek economy (% annual change, constant prices of the previous year) – MTFS 2013-2016

	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
GDP, constant prices	-6.5%	-4.5%	0.2%	2.5%	3.5%
Private consumption (Households + NPISH)	-7.7%	-7.0%	-1.6%	1.3%	2.3%
Government consumption	-6.2%	-7.2%	-3.1%	-1.9%	-3.0%
Total Investment	-15.0%	-3.7%	3.0%	7.0%	10.0%
Exports of goods and services	0.0%	2.6%	4.5%	5.3%	6.0%
Imports of goods and services	-10.1%	-5.2%	-0.4%	2.0%	3.1%

Table 2
Main aggregates of the Greek economy (constant prices of the previous year, in € million) - MTFS 2013-2016

	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
GDP	195,200	186,400	186,800	191,500	198,200
Private consumption (Households + NPISH)	141,674	131,756	129,648	131,334	134,354
Government consumption	34,713	32,214	31,215	30,622	29,703
Total Investment	25,520	24,576	25,313	27,085	29,794
Exports of goods and services	50,975	52,301	54,654	57,551	61,004
Imports of goods and services	59,603	56,503	56,277	57,403	59,182

The 2015 output vector is estimated on the basis of the following two methods:

(i) SIOT: We can express the input-output model as follows:

$$\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{Ax} + \mathbf{y} \quad (1)$$

where \mathbf{A} denotes the matrix of direct technical coefficients, \mathbf{x} the vector of outputs, and \mathbf{y} the vector of final demand (according to MTFS 2013-2016). Solving equation (1) for \mathbf{x} , we obtain:

$$\mathbf{x} = [\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{A}]^{-1} \mathbf{y} \quad (2)$$

where $[\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{A}]^{-1}$ is the Leontief inverse.

(ii) SUT: We can express the input-output model as follows:

$$\mathbf{Mz} = \mathbf{Uz} + \mathbf{y}$$

or

$$\mathbf{z} = [\mathbf{M} - \mathbf{U}]^{-1} \mathbf{y}$$

and

$$\mathbf{x} \equiv \mathbf{Mz} = \mathbf{M}[\mathbf{M} - \mathbf{U}]^{-1} \mathbf{y} \quad (3)$$

where \mathbf{M} denotes the Make matrix, \mathbf{U} the Use matrix, and \mathbf{z} the vector of activity levels.

RESULTS

The results of our analysis are summarized in Tables A.1 to A.4 (see the Appendix):

(i) Table A.1 shows the output of each sector in absolute numbers and as percentages, on the basis of both the SIOT and SUT for 2010 and 2015.

- (ii) Table A.2 ranks the main industries on the basis of their outputs.
- (iii) Table A.3 shows the main industries on the basis of their outputs at basic prices (in € million).
- (iv) Table A.4 shows a comparison of the output vectors on the basis of their different methods of estimation.

From these tables we may conclude that:

(i) Using the SIOT estimation, the total output increases from 351,385 to 453,886. The shares of Mining, Manufacturing and Energy increase, while those of Agriculture, Forestry & Fishing, Construction and Services decrease. Using the SUT estimation, the increase in total output is far greater, rising from 351,385 to 537,621. The shares of Mining, Manufacturing and Energy increase, while those of Agriculture, Forestry & Fishing, Construction and Services decrease.

(ii) The SIOT estimation results in remarkable changes in the industry rankings, the most important of which are the following: The third biggest industry in 2010 was Public Administration and Defense services, while in 2015 it is Water Transport services. Public Administration falls in 7th place. In 2010, Education services held 11th place, falling to 17th in 2015. Water Transport services, ranked 7th in 2010, are projected to climb to 3rd place in 2015. Mining & Quarrying, placed 19th in 2010, is projected to climb to 9th in 2015. Basic metals, Warehousing and support services for transportation and Mining & Quarrying occupied the three bottom places in 2010, while in 2015 the corresponding rankings were held by Education, Telecommunication and Wholesale and retail trade and repair services of motor vehicles and motorcycles. However, the main finding is the shrinking of the public sector industries. According to the SUT estimation, the three largest industries in 2005 are Basic metals, Crude petroleum, Mining & Quarrying. Real Estate falls in 4th place. Public Administration drops from 2nd to 8th place. Generally speaking, the public sector industries fall in the rankings, while the Manufacturing industries rise.

(iii) According to the SIOT estimation, the output of 11 main industries increases. Certain main industries, such as Wholesale trade, Food products and Water Transport Services grow, while other main industries, such as Construction, Real estate, Public administration, Education and Health contract. According to the SUT estimation, the output of 10 main industries increases. A number of industries such as Mining & Quarrying, Basic metals, Warehousing and support services for transportation show significant growth.

(iv) According to the SIOT estimation of the output vectors, 54 industries grow. According to the SUT estimation of the output vectors, 46 industries grow. In the case of Repair and installation services of

machinery and equipment, the negativity of the activity level indicates that the economic system, as shaped on the basis of our assumptions, is not capable of generating the projected vector of final demand.⁴

CONCLUDING REMARKS

On the basis of the implementation of the Medium-Term Fiscal Strategy 2013-2016 and input-output data of the Greek economy for the year 2010, this paper estimated the system output vector for the year 2015. The main conclusion is that both SIOT and SUT estimations result in an increase in the output levels in most industries and changes in the composition of their output. Another salient feature of our analysis is the reranking of Greek main industries during the examined period, while the public sector industries suffered a spectacular shrinkage.

Turning now to the actual official figures for the same aggregate real variables of the Greek economy, as reported by the National Statistical Service (ELSTAT), the total (private and public) final consumption estimated of constant prices of the previous year has declined. The same is true for total investment, while the value of imports fell and that of exports rose slightly. As for gross value added of the total economy, we observe a fall, and this fact is in stark contrast to the estimates of industry outputs which were made on the basis of the MTFS assumptions. Such a divergence from reality (in both sign and size) calls into question the official usually optimistic predictions.

Acknowledgements

We are indebted to an anonymous referee and the Editors of this journal for helpful comments, criticisms and suggestions on earlier versions of this paper.

Notes

1. Here by “outputs” we mean the row of “outputs at basic prices” as this appears in the input-output table of the year 2010.
2. In input-output analysis it is realistic to assume that the technical coefficients remain fixed or at most changes so slowly that does not alter qualitatively the result of the analysis. For the purposes of this study, we use the most recent input-output table, which for the Greek economy is available for the year 2010 (and provided via the EUROSTAT website, <http://epp.eurostat.ec.europa.eu>).
3. [http://www.hellenicparliament.gr/UserFiles/2f026f42-950c-4efc-b950-340c4fb76a24/%CE%88%CE%B3%CE%B3%CF%81%CE%B1%CF%86%CE%BF%20\(%CE%9C%CE%95%CE%A3%CE%9F%CE%A0%CE%A1%CE%9F%CE%98%CE%95%CE%A3%CE%9C%CE%9F_2013\).pdf](http://www.hellenicparliament.gr/UserFiles/2f026f42-950c-4efc-b950-340c4fb76a24/%CE%88%CE%B3%CE%B3%CF%81%CE%B1%CF%86%CE%BF%20(%CE%9C%CE%95%CE%A3%CE%9F%CE%A0%CE%A1%CE%9F%CE%98%CE%95%CE%A3%CE%9C%CE%9F_2013).pdf)

4. There are industries whose vector of activity levels is greater than 1 but whose output declines, as in the case of Telecommunications, while there are industries in which the opposite applies, such as Construction.

References

- Bank of Greece (2012), *Monetary Policy*, Interim Report No 6, June.
 Eurostat (2008), *Manual of Supply, Use and Input-Output Tables*, Luxembourg, European Communities.
 Hellenic Republic Ministry of Finance (2012), *Medium-Term Fiscal Strategy 2013-2016*, October (in Greek).
 Miller, R. E. and Blair, P. D. (2009), *Input-Output Analysis: Foundations and Extensions*, New York, Cambridge University Press.

APPENDIX

**Table A.1
Output of sectors - (SIOT methodology)**

2010 € million			2015 € million		
10,910	3.10%	Agriculture, Products of forestry, Fishing,	13,197	2.91%	Agriculture, Products of forestry, Fishing,
1,268	0.36%	Mining- Quarrying	16,649	3.67%	Mining - Quarrying
70,338	20.02%	Manufacturing, Energy	128,533	28.32%	Manufacturing, Energy
22,346	6.36%	Construction	21,217	4.67%	Construction
246,523	70.16%	Services	274,290	60.43%	Services
351,385		Total	453,886		Total

Output of sectors - (SUT methodology)

2010 € million			2015 € million		
12,216	3.48%	Agriculture, Products of forestry, Fishing,	17,217	3.20%	Agriculture, Products of forestry, Fishing,
1,320	0.38%	Mining - Quarrying	28,593	5.32%	Mining - Quarrying
67,130	19.10%	Manufacturing, Energy	215,974	40.17%	Manufacturing, Energy
21,769	6.19%	Construction	21,460	3.99%	Construction
248,950	70.85%	Services	254,377	47.32%	Services
351,385		Total	537,621		Total

Table A.2
Main industry rankings based on output

	SIOT methodology		SUT methodology	
	2010	2015	2010	2015
1 Real estate services	Real estate services	Real estate services	Real estate services	Basic metals
2 Wholesale trade services, except of motor vehicles and motorcycles	Wholesale trade services, except of motor vehicles and motorcycles	Public administration and defense services; compulsory social security services	Crude petroleum and natural gas; services incidental to oil and gas extraction excluding surveying	
3 Public administration and defense services; compulsory social security services	Water transport services	Construction work	Mining and quarrying	
4 Construction work	Crude petroleum and natural gas; services incidental to oil and gas extraction excluding surveying	Wholesale trade services, except of motor vehicles and motorcycles	Real estate services	
5 Accommodation and food services	Construction work	Accommodation and food services	Food products and beverages. Tobacco products	
6 Food products and beverages. Tobacco products	Food products and beverages. Tobacco products	Food products and beverages. Tobacco products	Water transport services	
7 Water transport services	Public administration and defense services; compulsory social security services	Water transport services	Construction work	
				<i>contd. table</i>

8	Health and social work services	Accommodation and food services	Retail trade services, except of motor vehicles and motorcycles	Public administration and defense services; compulsory social security services
9	Retail trade services, except of motor vehicles and motorcycles	Mining and quarrying	Health and social work services	Accommodation and food services
10	Crude petroleum and natural gas; services incidental to oil and gas extraction excluding surveying	Retail trade services, except of motor vehicles and motorcycles	Crude petroleum and natural gas; services incidental to oil and gas extraction excluding surveying	Electricity, gas, steam and air-conditioning
11	Education services	Warehousing and support services for transportation	Education services	Products of agriculture, hunting and related services
12	Financial intermediation services, except insurance and pension funding services	Financial intermediation services, except insurance and pension funding services	Financial intermediation services, except insurance and pension funding services	Wholesale trade services, except of motor vehicles and motorcycles
13	Products of agriculture, hunting and related services	Basic metals	Products of agriculture, hunting and related services	Financial intermediation services, except insurance and pension funding services
14	Wholesale and retail trade and repair services of motor vehicles and motorcycles	Electricity, gas, steam and air-conditioning	Electricity, gas, steam and air-conditioning	Warehousing and support services for transportation
15	Electricity, gas, steam and air-conditioning	Products of agriculture, hunting and related services	Telecommunications services	Health and social work services

contd. table

16	Telecommunications services	Health and social work services	Wholesale and retail trade and repair services of motor vehicles and motorcycles	Education services
17	Basic metals	Education services	Basic metals	Telecommunications services
18	Warehousing and support services for transportation	Telecommunications services	Warehousing and support services for transportation	Retail trade services, except of motor vehicles and motorcycles
19	Mining and quarrying	Wholesale and retail trade and repair services of motor vehicles and motorcycles	Mining and quarrying	Wholesale and retail trade and repair services of motor vehicles and motorcycles

Table A.3
Main industries based on output at basic prices (in million Euros)

	<i>SIOT estimation</i>		<i>SUT estimation</i>	
	<i>Output at basic prices 2010</i>	<i>Output at basic prices 2015</i>	<i>Output at basic prices 2010</i>	<i>Output at basic prices 2015</i>
Construction work	22,346	21,217	21,761	21,460
Wholesale and retail trade and repair services of motor vehicles and motorcycles	6,760	6,310	7,143	4,031
Wholesale trade and commission trade services, except of motor vehicles and motorcycles	25,369	27,698	24,544	14,831
Real estate services	31,707	29,455	27,854	28,535
Public administration and defense services; compulsory social security services	23,704	18,280	25,829	18,252
Accommodation and food services	20,863	16,922	21,112	16,923
Food products and beverages, Tobacco products	17,704	20,852	16,292	23,944
Water transport services	15,182	22,300	15,872	22,166
Retail trade services, except of motor vehicles and motorcycles	13,175	14,284	13,786	7,891
Health and social work services	14,436	10,997	13,694	11,016
Education services	11,761	9,472	11,888	9,526
Financial intermediation services, except insurance and pension funding services	10,253	13,702	10,428	13,741
Crude petroleum and natural gas; services incidental to oil and gas extraction excluding surveying	13,392	22,867	13,542	35,174
Products of agriculture, hunting and related services	9,578	11,530	10,961	15,026
Telecommunications services	8,166	9,293	8,785	9,662
Electricity, gas, steam and air-conditioning	8,260	11,751	8,321	16,355
Basic metals	4,696	12,018	4,950	36,876
Warehousing and support services for transportation	2,676	13,780	3,316	13,021
Mining and quarrying	1,268	16,649	1,320	28,593
Total	261,296	309,377	261,398	347,023
Percentage of output of the main industries to the total output vector	74.36%	68.16%	74.39%	64.55%

Table A.4
Comparison of output vectors based on the different methods of estimation

Industries	Output vector 2015 (SUT) € million	Vector of activity levels 2015 (SUT)	Output vector 2010 (SUT) €	Output vector 2010 (SIOT) €	Output vector 2015 (SIOT) €
Products of agriculture, hunting and related services	15,026	1.57	10,961	9,578	11,530
Products of forestry, logging and related services	535	5.85	76	134	206
Fish and other fishing products; aquaculture products;	1,656	1.40	1,179	1,198	1,462
support services to fishing					
Mining and quarrying	28,593	22.55	1,320	1,268	16,649
Food products, beverages and tobacco products	23,944	1.39	16,292	17,004	20,852
Textiles, wearing apparel and leather products	9,490	5.31	2,483	2,445	6,613
Wood and of products of wood and cork, except furniture; articles of straw and plaiting materials	12,650	8.91	1,493	1,479	3,142
Paper and paper products	4,164	3.66	1,094	1,140	2,330
Printing and recording services	1,677	1.51	1,190	1,071	1,167
Coke and refined petroleum products	35,174	2.60	13,542	13,392	22,867
Chemicals and chemical products	20,479	11.13	2,150	1,888	8,539
Basic pharmaceutical products and pharmaceutical preparations	6,314	3.70	1,765	1,642	5,198
Rubber and plastics products	7,373	4.81	1,573	1,545	3,706
Other non-metallic mineral products	5,106	1.77	2,968	2,827	3,976
Basic metals	36,876	7.85	4,950	4,696	12,018

contd. table

<i>Industries</i>	<i>Output vector 2015 (SUT) € million</i>	<i>Vector of activity levels 2015 (SUT)</i>	<i>Output vector 2010 (SUT) € million</i>	<i>Output vector 2010 (SIOT) € million</i>	<i>Output vector 2015 (SIOT) € million</i>
Fabricated metal products, except machinery and equipment	10,350	13.77	4,230	4,196	6,727
Computer, electronic and optical products	2,564	13.91	242	179	2,352
Electrical equipment	4,274	3.11	1,242	1,183	3,258
Machinery and equipment n.e.c.	3,522	11.56	999	1,172	3,219
Motor vehicles, trailers and semi-trailers	3,103	11.50	304	345	1,968
Other transport equipment	5,472	37.15	485	331	5,146
Furniture; other manufactured goods	2,699	1.21	1,779	1,601	2,024
Repair and installation services of machinery and equipment	610	-143.13	494	614	731
Electricity, gas, steam and air-conditioning	16,355	1.98	8,321	8,260	11,751
Natural water; water treatment and supply services	999	1.15	888	869	949
Sewerage; waste collection, treatment and disposal activities; materials recovery; remediation activities and other waste management services	2,789	1.10	2,453	2,458	3,290
Constructions and construction works	21,460	0.95	21,769	22,346	21,217
Wholesale and retail trade and repair services of motor vehicles and motorcycles	4,031	0.58	7,143	6,760	6,310
Wholesale trade services, except of motor vehicles and motorcycles	14,831	0.29	24,544	25,369	27,698
Retail trade services, except of motor vehicles and motorcycles	7,891	0.60	13,786	13,175	14,284

contd. table

INDUSTRY OUTPUTS ARISING FROM THE IMPLEMENTATION... / 157

<i>Industries</i>	<i>Output vector 2015 (SUT) € million</i>	<i>Vector of activity levels 2015 (SUT)</i>	<i>Output vector 2010 (SUT) € million</i>	<i>Output vector 2010 (SIOT) € million</i>	<i>Output vector 2015 (SIOT) € million</i>
Land transport services and transport services via pipelines	8,212	0.79	6,997	6,776	7,869
Water transport services	22,166	1.46	15,872	15,182	22,300
Air transport services	2,941	0.30	1,808	2,206	2,998
Warehousing and support services for transportation	13,021	5.48	3,316	2,676	13,780
Postal and courier services	2,596	1.72	1,566	1,514	2,203
Accommodation and food services	16,923	0.81	21,112	20,863	16,922
Publishing services	3,775	0.94	3,357	4,150	3,737
Motion picture, video and television programme production services, sound recording and music publishing; programming and broadcasting services	2,905	1.32	2,218	2,198	2,720
Telecommunications services	9,062	1.11	8,785	8,166	9,293
Computer programming, consultancy and related services; information services	1,955	1.04	1,885	1,883	1,945
Financial services, except insurance and pension funding services, reinsurance and pension funding services, except compulsory social security	13,741	1.34	10,428	10,253	13,702
Services auxiliary to financial services and insurance services	3,538	2.03	1,747	1,766	2,936
Real estate services	1,518	0.90	1,605	1,640	1,787
Legal and accounting services; services of head offices; management consulting services	28,535	0.90	27,854	31,707	29,455
	13,862	2.09	6,760	6,660	10,498

contd. table

<i>Industries</i>	<i>Output vector 2015 (SUT) € million</i>	<i>Vector of activity levels 2015 (SUT)</i>	<i>Output vector 2010 (SUT) € million</i>	<i>Output vector 2010 (SIOT) € million</i>	<i>Output vector 2015 (SIOT) € million</i>
Architectural and engineering services; technical testing and analysis services	6,484	1.33	4,885	4,875	5,733
Scientific research and development services	840	1.16	823	724	813
Advertising and market research services	3,966	1.31	3,044	3,032	3,890
Other professional, scientific and technical services; veterinary services	2,448	1.25	1,944	1,956	2,575
Rental and leasing services	3,135	2.40	1,189	1,320	2,503
Employment services	289	1.70	170	170	242
Travel agency, tour operator and other reservation services and related services	1,665	0.93	1,671	1,692	1,995
Security and investigation services; services to buildings and landscape; office administrative, office support and other business support services	9,433	1.69	4,580	6,178	8,510
Public administration and defense services; compulsory social security services	18,252	0.77	25,829	23,704	18,280
Education services	9,526	0.81	11,888	11,761	9,472
Human health services	11,018	0.82	13,694	13,436	10,997
Social work services	697	0.66	1,063	1,054	690

contd. table

INDUSTRY OUTPUTS ARISING FROM THE IMPLEMENTATION... / **159**

<i>Industries</i>	<i>Output vector 2015 (SUT) € million</i>	<i>Vector of activity levels 2015 (SUT)</i>	<i>Output vector 2010 (SUT) € million</i>	<i>Output vector 2010 (SIOT) € million</i>	<i>Output vector 2015 (SIOT) € million</i>
Creative, arts and entertainment services; library, archive, museum and other cultural services; gambling and betting services	4,716	1.20	3,921	3,938	4,611
Sporting services and amusement and recreation services	754	1.22	586	635	700
Services furnished by membership organizations	4,068	1.05	3,874	3,874	3,999
Repair services of computers and personal and household goods	1,459	1.40	1,034	1,034	1,431
Other personal services	2,838	1.01	2,787	2,816	2,841
Services of households as employers; undifferentiated goods and services produced by households for own use	1,282	0.93	1,379	1,379	1,282
Total	537,621		351,385	351,385	453,886

