

## **THE STUDY OF SATISFACTION AMONG PHYSICIANS WITH THE EDUCATION QUALITY WHILE OBTAINING NEW QUALIFICATION IN TERMS OF ADDITIONAL VOCATIONAL EDUCATION**

Irina Anatolyevna Egorova<sup>1\*</sup>, Alexander Dmitrievich Buchnov<sup>1</sup>,  
Elena Romanovna Zinkevich<sup>2</sup> and Andrey Evgenievich Chervotok<sup>1</sup>

---

The article demonstrates the results of a research that took place in the additional professional education establishment – the V.L. Andrianov Institute of Osteopathic Medicine – in the 2015-2016 academic year, the goal of which was to study the satisfaction among doctors mastering Osteopathic Specialty with the quality of education at the initial stage of training.

The research is based on a socio-anthropological or explanatory conception, in the context of which the evaluation allows analyzing both the entire educational process and its components.

To achieve the goal, a questionnaire was developed containing questions related to the specifics of training at the V.L. Andrianov Institute of Osteopathic Medicine.

In the article, results of the analysis of answers to the questionnaire questions are presented and measured up against subjective, standard and individual variable indicators.

Based on the results of the conducted research, the idea of the physicians' satisfaction with the education quality at the initial stage of mastering the new qualification was formed; the problems of the educational process at the Institute were revealed. The results of the study served as the basis for modifying Module: Cranial Osteopathy; they entailed the need to develop a program for teachers' professional growth.

**Keywords:** education quality; evaluation; additional vocational education; teachers' level of professional qualification in postgraduate and additional vocational education.

### **I. INTRODUCTION**

In the middle of the second decade of the 21<sup>st</sup> century, at all levels of the Russian education system, the problem of the education quality is actualized, due to educational reforms that call for the use of tools for assessing the education quality in order to bring it closer to European standards.

The problem of improving the quality of postgraduate professional education of adult students who already have medical qualifications is very relevant both in the global context and in the context of the educational establishments of the Russian system of additional vocational education, which includes the V. L. Andrianov Institute of Osteopathic Medicine.

---

<sup>1</sup> V. Andrianov Institute of Osteopathic Medicine, St. Petersburg, Yaroslav-the-Wise Novgorod State University, Velikiy Novgorod, *E-mails: egorova\_osteo@mail.ru; okean50@mail.ru; andro-med@rambler.ru*

<sup>2</sup> Saint-Petersburg State Pediatric Medical University, St.Petersburg, *E-mail: lenazinkevich@mail.ru*

In the 90s of the 20<sup>th</sup> century in Russia, education was seen as a way and a process of transferring knowledge, skills and competencies, in this connection, the students' learning and cognitive activity was far from the content of life, which coincided with the concept of a knowledge model of education. The goal of education was the uptake of educational content, and this coincided with a general decline in interest in learning and, as a result, in the expansion of the possibilities of one's professional activity.

But already in the late nineties the traditional knowledge-based model of education began to be characterized by aggravation of various contradictions conditioned by the peculiarities of the social situation in Russia and the peculiarities of the stage of the Russian education system development, which could not but affect the education quality.

The beginning of the second decade of the 21<sup>st</sup> century in Russia was marked by global changes in the structure and nature of the market, informatization and computerization of social and production spheres of life, the emergence of a new technogenic civilization, the integration of the Russian educational system into the Bologna process, which actualized the education quality at its all levels.

At present, the dominant direction in the system of education in general and in the system of additional vocational education during the transition to a new education quality has become a learner-centered paradigm. This paradigm predetermines the rejection of the conception of the educational process, accepted within the framework of the traditional authoritarian paradigm, as a trajectory, according to which the trainee follows standardly, and the change in the vision of the education quality [3], [6].

The main sense of the learner-centered approach in education is that education is not identified with the way the knowledge, skills and competencies are transferred, but is interpreted as a way of personal development. A person (a learner) in this case is understood as a subject of his/her educational, cognitive and professional activities.

Thus, the process of development of the individual as the coordinator of activity constitutes the main direction of modern education. That is why today, postgraduate vocational education is viewed as a continuous process of learner-centered development, which, in turn, makes special demands for the organization of the educational process in the educational institutions of the system of additional vocational training [4], [7], [11].

Russian state policy in the field of additional vocational education in the context of the Bologna agreements provides for changes in approaches to evaluation and indicators of its quality, as N.M. Ladnushkina states in her article [14].

According to Russian scientists, quality in education is viewed from two points of view: from the perspective of the result and in the context of the process aimed

at achieving the planned result regarding the external and internal features of the object [15].

In particular, from the point of view of E.A. Palmova, while discussing the problem of the education quality, it is necessary to differentiate what is relevant to the process, and what concerns the result [11].

The indicators of the education quality are conventionally divided into two groups, which include: indicators characterizing the quality of educational process and indicators characterizing the level of students' training. On this basis, the objectives of the education quality assessment is to determine the level and dynamics of the students' learning achievements; the identification of strong and weak points in the emerging competencies and skills of students, the identification of strong and weak points in educational process and pedagogical skills of teachers.

As an example, studies of European scientists in the field of education quality indicators can be cited. The main methods for determining the education quality are assessment, accreditation, audit and ranking, meta-assessments, test models for evaluating the educational system, etc. [1], [2], [5].

At present, from our point of view, there can be the only source of development of the education quality management, which is actually in the educational system of educational institutions of additional vocational training. Quality management determines the identification of correspondence of the implemented learning technology to different groups of students and the timeliness of conducting corrective pedagogical actions. The condition for the development of the education quality is the reflexive analysis of one's own pedagogical activity. Evaluation is one of the tools for achieving the education quality.

The concept of "evaluation" arose at the turn of the 60's – 70's in the 20<sup>th</sup> century in European science and was used to assess the effectiveness of teachers' educational activities based on the study and analysis of their experience.

Turning to one of the early publications devoted to the evaluation, we see that, from the author's point of view, the evaluation is an impartial perception and reproduction of objectively existing pedagogical reality, on the one hand, and on the other, a subjective assessment of the data obtained and their analysis through pedagogical reflection, observation and subsequent discussion with colleagues [10], [7].

In this vein, the evaluation is seen as an instrument of self-management, self-organization, design and development of the educational process.

The term itself is characterized by interdisciplinarity, as the development of its application scenario was carried out in the field of economic, mathematical, pedagogical, and psychological sciences, later in marketing and management. It is natural that evaluation methods were interdisciplinary research methods – regression, dispersion and factor analysis, interviews, questionnaires, etc.

In the last quarter of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, B. McDonald can be mentioned as one of the well-known researchers of the problems of evaluation and scope of its application, who carried out the classification of evaluation. The scientist identified three types of evaluation, among them are bureaucratic, autocratic and democratic; each of them solves its problems [11]. Following the selected types of evaluation, researchers began to refer to the management function, the function of certification and accreditation, the monitoring function and the function of representativeness as its functional features [8].

In the 21<sup>st</sup> century, European scientists' views on the evaluation have not changed so much, but the understanding about the boundaries of its use has expanded. In particular, the evaluation began to be considered as a process necessary for continuous development, grounded on traditional pedagogical values in education [9].

In recent years in Europe, quite a lot of research has been devoted to the problem of evaluation, which describe various information systems with multiple criteria for the implementation of the process of evaluation and teachers' professional development [2], [3].

It is often possible to find publications in which the evaluation is used to assess the educational space, educational projects [4], [6].

The evaluation came in the Russian pedagogical science at the beginning of the 21<sup>st</sup> century in connection with the actualization of the problem of the education quality.

Having carried out the transfer of opportunities for evaluation to the institution of additional vocational education – V. L. Andrianov Institute of Osteopathic Medicine, we adhered to the point of view that the democratic evaluation is relevant to this educational system, which reveals the features of the technological, didactic and organizational substructures of the institute, curricula and syllabi.

We have been carrying out our research, proceeding from the tasks of democratic evaluation. In our case, the evaluation solves regulatory tasks that allow the teaching staff not only to critically evaluate the results of their own teaching activity, but, if necessary, change its tactics.

At the V. L. Andrianov Institute of Osteopathic Medicine a purposeful systematic work on the creation of a quality management system is being brought about. The quality management in education is a purposeful and coordinated activity of all participants of the educational system to achieve the planned learning outcomes. Information support for the process of quality management in education is achieved through a variety of monitoring and evaluation tools, one of which is a questionnaire [11]. The results of questioning are the basis for critical analysis, possible forecasting, timely correction of the structural components of the learning process, ensuring the quality of training and the quality of education of osteopathic physicians.

The possibility of conducting a research of this nature is accounted for, on the one hand, the study of learning adults' satisfaction by the education quality, on the

other, the value of studying the teachers' level of professional qualification, affecting the quality of students' education.

In the course of the study, we suggested that satisfaction with the quality of adult learners' education at the initial stage of mastering the new specialty of osteopathic *physician* depends primarily on the teachers' level (reproductive, standardized, methodical, creative and strategic) of professional qualification at the V. L. Andrianov Institute of Osteopathic Medicine.

In the process of the study preparation, we gave a description of teachers' level of professional qualification and familiarized adult students with the features of each professional level.

Table 1 presents teachers' level of professional qualification, illustrating their professional skills in the conditions of clinical training of learners.

TABLE I: TEACHERS' LEVEL OF PROFESSIONAL QUALIFICATION IN CONDITIONS OF CLINICAL TRAINING OF STUDENTS

<i>Teachers' level of professional qualification</i>	<i>Characteristics of teachers' level of professional qualification</i>
reproductive level	expressed in the ability to stereotype the borrowed pedagogical actions that provide the solution of specific educational tasks in the conditions of clinical training of learners; the fulfillment of these actions is conditioned by the previously formed ideas about the ways of their implementation;
standardized level	expressed in the ability to identify the pedagogical situation and in an effort to find a way out of it through a well-known means, repeatedly observed in colleagues' actions; there is no critical analysis of one's own pedagogical activity, there is a misunderstanding of the role of vocational education in the educational process, organized on a clinical site;
methodological level	expressed in mature ideas about the method of teaching the subject in the conditions of clinical training of students, in the ability to use existing forms and methods of teaching; in the desire to resolve pedagogical situations; the ability to reflect the pedagogical activity and the desire to discuss professional problems with colleagues are pointed out;
creative level	expressed in the ability to rethink one's own stereotypes of pedagogical behavior, there is the ability to pedagogical reflection, there is a readiness for methodological discoveries and the creation of one's own pedagogical system of teaching and upbringing in the clinical training of students, an ability to creativity in pedagogical activity is expressed; the ability to resolve pedagogical situations in a non-standard, but expedient way is noted.
strategic level	the readiness for research activity, ability to reflexive analysis of one's own pedagogical activity and critical analysis of colleagues' activity are noted, which implies improvement of the quality of the educational process at the clinical site; there is an ability to find the way out of their pedagogical situations through a non-standard means; there is a willingness to design pedagogical activity, introduce novations and innovations into it.

Teachers' level of professional qualification at the higher medical school is the quality of their professional competencies, supported by the previously formed and existing potentials, stipulated by a combination of internal and external factors, such as individual and typological features and abilities, professional motivation and professional training, the specificity of the clinical practice in which personal and professional formation took place.

The main criterion in assessing the teachers' level of professional qualification is their ability to solve pedagogical problems, subject the results of one's own pedagogical activity to reflection and transform this activity on a scientific and methodical basis to solve the problems of personal and professional development of trainees – physicians [13].

Mastering the program of additional professional education in Specialty Osteopathy is implemented through a system of workshops, each of which involves the study of one topic or a section at a certain stage of the program. For example, the Section: Common Osteopathic Aspects is the prelude to the study of the Section: Cranial Module. The result of the quality of acquiring this section immediately affects all subsequent theoretical and practical activities. Strict adherence to the structure of the program entails the need to learners' reflection so that in the early stages of obtaining a new qualification their educational needs, expectations and requests were fully satisfied.

The analysis of the research results indicates that the Institute's teachers have difficulties in structuring and systematizing the educational material in the classroom; they do not fully understand the ways of creating situations of the educational dialogue enabling students to comprehend the theoretical material presented. It is no coincidence that when discussing the problems of the quality of postgraduate vocational education, adult learners mention the status of teachers' professional, methodological and didactic competence as the main reasons affecting the quality of their education.

The results obtained by us during the survey were the basis for the actualization of the problem of upgrading teachers' level of professional qualification at the V. L. Andrianov Institute of Osteopathic Medicine in terms of the development of their methodological and didactic competence. To upgrade the teachers' level of professional qualification and involve them in the process of professional growth in connection with the solution of the problems of additional professional education quality the Pedagogy and Psychology of the Higher School Program aimed at overcoming the difficulties of teachers, conditioned by the level of their professional pedagogical training, should be developed and implemented.

## **II. MATERIALS AND METHODS OF RESEARCH**

A study aimed at studying physicians' satisfaction with the education quality at the initial stage of mastering qualification: Osteopathic Physician which is new for

them was held at the V. L. Andrianov Institute of Osteopathic Medicine in 2015-2016 academic year.

The total number of participants in the study was 26 (100%); all of them had higher medical education; the average age of the respondents was 36; all participants in the research were women.

To study the evaluation of the quality of the proposed training material, the questionnaire “Critical Analysis of the Education Quality at Cycle 1 and Suggestions for its Improvement (using the example of Module: Cranial Osteopathy)”, developed by the Institute’s staff, was used.

In this questionnaire, the questions are conventionally divided into two parts: the first part of the questionnaire involves the definition of the quality assessment of the educational material; the second part contains questions, the answers to which allow identifying the resources for optimizing the education quality at the Institute.

The questions were presented as open-ended questions and provided for own answers in a written form.

Table 2 proposes the questionnaire content

TABLE II. QUESTIONNAIRE “CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF THE EDUCATION QUALITY AT CYCLE 1 AND SUGGESTIONS FOR ITS IMPROVEMENT (USING THE EXAMPLE OF MODULE: CRANIAL OSTEOPATHY)”

---

A questionnaire is introduced for your consideration; its purpose is to identify the causes affecting the education quality at the V. L. Andrianov Institute of Osteopathic Medicine.

Answers to these questions and your suggestions will be the basis for improving the learning process and, as a consequence, the education quality.

The survey is conducted anonymously.

---

Specify the main reasons that cause you difficulties in the perception of the educational material in the classroom:

- the material is not sufficiently structured and systematized;
  - there are no visual aids;
  - poor quality of presentation of instructional materials;
  - other reasons.
- 

Specify the main reasons that make it difficult for you to learn the material:

- insufficient number of hours to study the topic;
  - there are no methodological aids;
  - the teacher does not create situations for comprehending theoretical material;
  - other reasons.
- 

Name the main reasons upon which the quality of your education depends:

- professional (profile and pedagogical) competence of the teacher;
  - revision and control of mastering the material covered
  - presence of the student’s educational and professional motivation;
  - other reasons.
-

Evaluate the pedagogical skills of the teacher lecturing Module: Cranial Osteopathy according to the 5-point scale

- 5 points – a high level of teacher’s pedagogical skills;
- 4 points – a good level of teacher’s pedagogical skills;
- 3 points – an average level of teacher’s pedagogical skills;
- 2 points – a low level of teacher’s pedagogical skills;
- 1 point – a bad level of teacher’s pedagogical skills.

---

Your suggestions for improving the learning process referring to the main sections of osteopathy.

---

The analysis of the results of questioning was carried out taking into account subjective, standard and individual variable indicators.

Subjective indicators showed the difficulties experienced by learners in the perception of the learning material in the classroom and their assessment of the pedagogical skills of the teacher lecturing Module: Cranial Osteopathy.

Standard indicators revealed the reasons preventing the subsequent assimilation of the educational material by students.

Individual variable indicators illustrated students’ suggestions for improving the quality of teaching the main sections relating to osteopathy.

### III. RESULTS

From the respondents’ point of view, the lack of structuring and systematization of the educational material, the inability of teachers to prioritize the content of theoretical material, the logical incompleteness of studies – these are the main reasons for the difficulty in the perception of educational materials in the classroom.

Considering the main causes that make it difficult for learners to acquire the material, it can be noted that this is, first of all, the lack of teacher’s didactic abilities to conduct constructive educational dialogue.

In the course of the study, trainees – 21 persons – assessed the level of professional qualification of the teacher lecturing Module: Cranial Osteopathy as a standardized one, 5 persons stated the methodical professional level of the teacher.

These results should prompt the administration at the Institute to seek ways to improve the methodological and didactic components of the learning process.

Of all participants in the survey, only two respondents made suggestions for improving the learning process for the main sections related to osteopathy, these proposals concerned changes in the content of the educational subject and learners’ independent work.

### IV. DISCUSSION

Let us give a description of the results obtained during this research.

In particular, 14 respondents pointed out the lack of structuring and systematization of educational material as the main reasons causing difficulties for students in the perception of educational material. One respondent noted the

logical incompleteness of the lesson, and another participant of the research drew attention to the absence of visual aids in the class. The remaining 10 persons noted that the difficulty in the perception of educational material is explained solely by their lack of discipline and lack of organization.

Thus, the greatest problem that makes it difficult for students to perceive learning material is the lack of structuring and systematization of the material by the teacher. This is the reason for the fact that teachers do not fully understand the didactic principles of education, in particular, they have no idea of the principle of systematic and consistent presentation of educational material, scientific approach, one of the conditions of which is a logical sequence in the presentation of theoretical material.

Describing the main reasons for the difficulties in acquiring learning material, 18 people mentioned the teachers' inability to conduct an educational dialogue. These results appear as indirect evidence that teachers do not fully possess verbal methods of instruction, in particular, educational dialogue. In the organization of the educational dialogue in the classroom, the teacher's pedagogical position is manifested, and it becomes the most important factor in the development of the learners' personality, since tactful and expedient interaction with them is one of the provisions of the modern paradigm of vocational education.

The teacher's ability to conduct an educational dialogue is formed as a result of an active discussion of learning issues. This aspect should be taken into account by the organizers of the educational process in order to encourage teachers to share their own pedagogical experience among colleagues.

The remaining participants in the study – 8 persons – pointed out the state of their cognitive processes as reasons for the difficulty of acquiring teaching/learning materials. The ways to overcome these personal problems, from our point of view, can be trainings contributing to the development of students' cognitive processes in order to improve their ability to comprehend, remember and preserve information.

The main reasons for the education quality, in the opinion of 18 respondents, are the teacher's professional (profile and pedagogical) competence; 8 persons indicated the need for a revision and control of the retention of gained knowledge. Thus, here again, respondents note the professional readiness of the teacher for pedagogical activity, expressed through special skills.

Unfortunately, not all respondents are ready to contribute suggestions to improve teaching of the main sections related to osteopathy. Such a situation can be explained by the inability of participants in the educational process to put forward proposals of a constructive nature, to form an educational order, accepting part of the obligations.

The respondents' proposals concerning changes in the content of the academic discipline and independent work must be taken into account, since the organization of the educational process at the Institute of Osteopathic Medicine is intended to

ensure a modern scientific level of training osteopathic physicians, establishing an optimal balance between theoretical and practical learning, creating optimal conditions for mastering educational programs by students and their independent work.

Thanks to students' independent work, the teacher receives information that indicates the peculiarities of their educational and cognitive activities. Analysis of the information obtained may lead to a change in the content of education, strategies and tactics of training, the restructuring of the entire educational process. One cannot fail to note the fact that quite often independent work affects students' self-evaluation.

### **CONCLUSION**

All the data obtained convince of the need to involve teachers in the critical analysis of their pedagogical activities in order to ensure, on the one hand, the quality of postgraduate education, on the other, to contribute to the success of teachers in pedagogical activity. Along with this, the results of the screening research actualize the problem of raising the level of competency of teachers who do not have pedagogical qualifications with consideration for their age, psychological and professional characteristics, conditioned by the specificity of the osteopathic physician's activity.

Assessment of the education quality can be considered as part of the educational process, and part of knowledge acquisition. It should be taken into account that the evaluation of the education quality not only contributes to overcoming the internal problems of the learning process itself, but also contributes to the development of reflection, critical thinking, and ensures students' self-actualization. Assessment of the education quality and analysis of the results of this assessment should not only be indicators, but catalysts that contribute to improving the actual quality of education.

The focus of the organizers of the learning process in the system of postgraduate and additional vocational education should be issues related to the goal-setting of training sessions, their content, the choice of the best methods and means of teaching, which provide teachers with achievement of the assigned tasks; attention should be paid to problems concerning the process of knowledge acquisition by adult learners and motivational aspects of their learning and cognitive activities.

Thus, when discussing the problem of the education quality and evaluation as a mechanism for identifying this quality, it is necessary to correlate the satisfaction with the education quality by adult students with teachers' competence, which fully confirms the hypothesis of our study. Along with this, one cannot ignore the need to analyze the methodological and didactic orientation of teacher performance, which should be discussed at the scientific and methodological and pedagogical councils in the institutions of the postgraduate and additional professional education system, a part of which is the V. L. Andrianov Institute of Osteopathic Medicine.

In turn, the results obtained by us, urgently require the development and approbation of a professional development program for teachers at the Institute of Osteopathic Medicine in the field of study: Pedagogy and Psychology of Higher Education, the goal of which is the development of methodological and didactic competence of teachers.

The results of the research allow us to draw the following conclusion: the education quality, in particular, in the system of postgraduate and additional professional education is a systemic problem and it cannot be considered in isolation from teachers' competence.

### *Acknowledgment*

The writing team thanks and expresses gratitude to the participants of the study – learners mastering the first cycle of training at the V. L. Andrianov Institute of Osteopathic Medicine.

It is to be hoped that the results obtained will affect the creation of a quality management system at the Institute, which, ultimately, will change teachers' attitude towards educational work and increase their responsibility for the quality of education of future specialists.

### *References*

- Beatrice L. Bridglall, Jade Caines, Madhabi Chatterji. Understanding validity issues in test-based models of school and teacher evaluation // *Quality Assurance in Education*. 2014, Vol. 22, Iss: 1. P. 19–30. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/QAE-12-2013-0053>.
- Carlos A. Bana e Costa, Mónica D. Oliveira. A multicriteria decision analysis model for faculty evaluation // *Omega (The international journal of management science)*. August 2012. Volume 40, Iss. 4. P. 424–436. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.omega.2011.08.006>.
- Clement Adelman. Methodology and Educational Evaluation: A Learner-centered View // *Case Study Evaluation: Past, Present and Future Challenges (Advances in Program Evaluation, Volume 15)* Emerald Group Publishing Limited, 2015. P. 1–18. DOI: 10.1108/S1474-786320140000015001.
- Fabio Dovigo, Vincenza Rocco. Evaluating European Inquiry-Based Education Projects through the Lens of Evaluation Capacity Building // *Innovations in Higher Education Teaching and Learning, Volume 4*), Emerald Group Publishing Limited, 2015. P. 257–282. DOI: 10.1108/S2055-364120150000004015.
- Jan Vanhoof, Peter Van Petegem/ Judging and explaining the quality of school self-evaluations: Indicators and findings on meta-evaluation from a Flemish perspective // *Advances in Program Evaluation*. 2014, Volume 14, Emerald Group Publishing Limited. P. 275–291. DOI: 10.1108/S1474-7863(2013)0000014016.
- Lisa Germany. Learning Space Evaluations – Timing, Team, Techniques // *Book Series: International Perspectives on Higher Education Research*, 2014. ISSN: 1479-3628, P. 267–288. DOI: 10.1108/S1479-362820140000012018.
- M. Filipe, F. Ferreira & S. J. Santos. A multiple criteria information system for pedagogical evaluation and professional development of teachers // *Journal of the Operational Research Society*, November 2015, Volume 66, Iss. 11. P. 1769–1782. DOI: DOI: 10.1057/jors.2014.129.

- N. Nieveen & E. Folmer. Formative Evaluation in Educational Design Research // Educational Design Research, Enschede, November. 2013. P. 152–169. ISBN: 978 90 329 2334 1.
- P. Murray, A. Douglas-Dunbar, Sh. Murray. Evaluating values-centred pedagogies in education for sustainable development // International Journal of Sustainability in Higher Education, 2014, Vol. 15 Iss: 3. P. 314–329. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/IJSHE-03-2012-0021>.
- Th. Liket. Freiheit und Verantwortung. Das niederländische Modell des Bildungswesens. Gütersloh, 1993. S. 118. ISBN-10: 3892041180 ISBN-13: 978-3892041184.
- E.A. Palmova. Evaluation as an integral component of modern education // Bulletin of the Taganrog Institute of Management and Economics. 2011. No. 2. Pp. 85-90. [Http://elibrary.ru/item.asp?id=16405360](http://elibrary.ru/item.asp?id=16405360).
- E.R. Zinkevich. Methodological support of teachers in assessing the education quality of students of medical schools // Bulletin of the South Ural University. 2013. No. 15). Pp. 116-119. [Http://elibrary.ru/item.asp?id=18899586](http://elibrary.ru/item.asp?id=18899586).
- E.R. Zinkevich. Teachers' level of professional qualification at higher medical school: results of research at the faculty of postgraduate and additional professional education // European Social Science Journal. 2016. No. 12-1. Pp. 167-173. <http://elibrary.ru/item.asp?id=28314794>
- N.M. Ladnushkina. Federal control of the education quality as one of the factors for improving the education quality // The Eurasian Union of Scientists. 2015. No. 3-1 (12). Pp. 71-73. [Http://elibrary.ru/item.asp?id=27497070](http://elibrary.ru/item.asp?id=27497070).
- V.N. Pugach, Kirsanov K.A. Alimova N.K. The education quality: an invitation to reflection. Monograph. Moscow: Publishing and Trading Corporation "Dashkov and K", 2011. 195 pp. ISBN 978-5-394-01381-2: (transl.).